



Dan Monceaux

Email: foi+request-2850-4d0c454f@righttoknow.org.au

Dear Mr Monceaux

Freedom of Information Request No. 161205
Decision on Access

I refer to your request of 14 December 2016 to the Department of the Environment and Energy (the **Department**) under the *Freedom of Information Act 1982* (the **FOI Act**). Your request seeks access to:

All formal submissions received by the department in response to the EPBC Act referral for CENTREX METALS LIMITED/Transport - Water/Within the Spencer Gulf approx 210km north-west Adelaide/South Australia/Port Spencer Stage 1 and 2, Eyre Peninsula, SA (Ref#2012/6590).

Authority

I am authorised by the Secretary of the Department under section 23 of the FOI Act to make a decision in relation to your request.

Decision

The Department has identified ten documents relevant to the scope of your request (one document, document 5, includes one separate attachment making eleven documents in total).

I have decided to:

- **grant access** to Document 9 in full; and
- **grant access** to Documents 1 through 8 and 10 in part, as they contain material that I consider exempt pursuant to section 47F of the FOI Act, or irrelevant to the request pursuant to section 22 of the FOI Act.

A schedule describing these documents and my decision in respect of each is at **ATTACHMENT A**. **ATTACHMENT B** contains information regarding your review rights, should you wish to seek review of my decision.

The documents are at **ATTACHMENT C**.

Material considered in making my decision

I had regard to:

- the scope of the FOI request
- the content of the documents subject to your request;
- the relevant provisions in the FOI Act;
- advice from subject matter experts within the Department;
- the *Guidelines issued by the Australian Information Commissioner under s93A of the Freedom of Information Act 1982* (the **FOI Guidelines**).

Reasons for decision

Material deleted pursuant to Section 22

Deletion of irrelevant material

Section 22 of the FOI Act allows for information that is irrelevant to your request to be deleted. The documents captured by your request include the personal information of junior government officers and the personal contact information of senior government officers. As iterated in our correspondence of 16 December 2016, the Department considers this material to be irrelevant to the scope of a request where no representation has been made that they be specifically included. The Department has not received a representation to this effect. Accordingly, I have decided that the personal information of junior government officers and the personal contact details of senior officers are irrelevant to the scope of your request and have deleted that information from documents 1 and 2 pursuant to section 22 of the FOI Act.

Material exempted under section 47F

Personal privacy

Section 47F(1) of the FOI Act provides that where the disclosure of document would result in an unreasonable disclosure of personal information about any person (including a deceased person), that document is conditionally exempt. The conditionally exempt document may then be withheld from release to the applicant only if access to it would be against the public interest.

Unreasonable disclosure of information

Documents 3 through 8 and 10 contain the names, addresses, telephone numbers and/or email addresses of members of the public who had made the submissions that are the subject of this request. I am satisfied that this information is "personal information" for the purposes of the FOI Act.

To determine whether the disclosure of this personal information was unreasonable, I gave regard to the following criteria under 47F(2) of the FOI Act:

- (a) the extent to which the information is well known;
- (b) whether the person to whom the information relates is known to be (or to have been) associated with the matters dealt with in the document;
- (c) the availability of the information from publicly accessible sources;
- (d) any other matters that the Authority considers relevant.

Against these criteria, I consider that:

- (a) the information is not well known;
- (b) the persons are not known to be associated with the matters dealt with in the document;
and
- (c) the information is not available from publicly accessible sources.

Against criteria (d), and consistent with the decision in *Re Chandra and Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs* [1984] AATA 437, I considered all relevant circumstances, including the nature of the information, the purpose for which the information was obtained, the likelihood of the information being information which the person concerned would not wish to have disclosed, and whether the information has any current relevance as set out in.

With reference to my findings above, I consider that any disclosure of the names, addresses, telephone numbers and/or email addresses of members of the public who had made submissions contained within the documents would be unreasonable, and therefore that this personal information is conditionally exempt. I will consider whether access to this personal information would be contrary to the public interest.

Contrary to the public interest

To determine whether access to the conditionally exempt personal information would be contrary to the public interest, I must consider those public interest factors favouring access to the personal information and weigh them against those public interest factors against access. If satisfied that the public interest factors against access outweigh those favouring access, I may decide that access to the personal information is contrary to the public interest.

I did not consider any of the irrelevant factors set out in section 11B(4) of the FOI Act.

Section 11B(3) sets out the public interest factors that favour access to information:

- (a) promote the objects of this Act (including all the matters set out in sections 3 and 3A);*
- (b) inform debate on a matter of public importance;*
- (c) promote effective oversight of public expenditure;*
- (d) allow a person to access his or her own personal information.*

Against these factors, I consider that access to the names, addresses, telephone numbers and/or email addresses of members of the public who had made the submissions contained within Documents 3 through 8 and 10:

- (a) would promote the objects of the FOI Act in respect of providing access to information held by the Government (promoting section 3(1)(b)) and that the information is a national resource (section 3(3)).

However, I do not consider that this specific personal information would allow for greater insight into Government decision making (section 3(2)(a)) or that their release would allow for increased discussion or scrutiny of Government activities (section 3(3));

- (b) would not inform debate on a matter of public importance;
- (c) would not promote effective oversight of public expenditure; and
- (d) would not allow a person, being the applicant, further access to his or her own personal information.

Paragraph 6.22 of the FOI Guidelines provides a non-exhaustive list of public interest factors against access. Of these factors, I consider that access to the names, addresses, telephone numbers and/or email addresses of members of the public who had made the submissions contained within Documents 3 through 8 and 10:

(a) *could reasonably be expected to prejudice the protection of an individual's right to privacy*

After considering the public interest factors favouring access and those against access, I consider that the factors against access to outweigh those favouring access, and that access to the personal information discussed above to be contrary the public interest.

I have therefore decided to withhold access and conditionally exempt the names, addresses, telephone numbers and/or email addresses of members of the public who had made the submissions contained within Documents 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 10 pursuant to section 47F of the FOI Act.

Disclosure Log

Pursuant to section 11C of the FOI Act, the Department will publish the documents at **ATTACHMENT C** on their website within 10 days of providing you with this decision.

Further assistance

The FOI Contact Officer in the Department can be contacted by telephone on 02 6274 2098 or by email at foi@environment.gov.au.

Yours sincerely



Patrick McInerney
A/g Assistant Secretary
Assessments (WA, SA & NT) and Air Branch

18 January 2017

ATTACHMENTS:

- A.** Schedule of documents
- B.** Information sheet "Your Review Rights"
- C.** Documents subject to your request



Australian Government

Department of the Environment and Energy

ATTACHMENT A

FOI 161205 Schedule of Documents

No	Description	Decision
1	Ministerial Submission : Department of Resources, Energy and Tourism	<i>Release in part</i> s 22 - personal information of government officers, agreed to be outside of scope
2	Ministerial Submission : SA Department of Environment, Water and Natural Resources	<i>Release in part</i> s 22 - personal information of government officers, agreed to be outside of scope
3	Public Submission : in relation to Port Spencer - Stage 1 and 2	<i>Release in part</i> s 47F - unreasonable disclosure of personal information of a person making a public submission
4	Public Submission : in relation to Port Spencer - Stage 1 and 2	<i>Release in part</i> s 47F - unreasonable disclosure of personal information of a person making a public submission
5	Public Submission : in relation to Port Spencer - Stage 1 and 2 and its Attachment	<i>Release in part</i> s 47F - unreasonable disclosure of personal information of a person making a public submission
5a	Attachment to submission in 5a	<i>Release in part</i> s 47F - unreasonable disclosure of personal information of a person making a public submission
6	Public Submission : in relation to Port Spencer - Stage 1 and 2	<i>Release in part</i> s 47F - unreasonable disclosure of personal information of a person making a public submission
7	Public Submission : in relation to Port Spencer - Stage 1 and 2	<i>Release in part</i> s 47F - unreasonable disclosure of personal information of a person making a public submission
8	Public Submission : in relation to Port Spencer - Stage 1 and 2 (Conservation Council SA)	<i>Release in part</i> s 47F - unreasonable disclosure of personal information of a person making a public submission
9	Public Submission : in relation to Port Spencer - Stage 1 and 2	<i>Release in full</i>
10	Public Submission : in relation to Port Spencer - Stage 1 and 2	<i>Release in part</i> s 47F - unreasonable disclosure of personal information of a person making a public submission



YOUR REVIEW RIGHTS

You may seek review of this primary decision either internally by the Department (Internal review), or externally by the Information Commissioner (Information Commissioner review).

Internal review

An Internal review is a review of the decision conducted by a senior officer within the Department. The reviewing officer will not be the same person whom made the primary decision.

If you wish to seek an internal review, you must submit a written application to the Department within 30 days after the day you are notified of this decision. Whilst there is no required form for the written Internal Review application, it is recommended that you include your reasons as to why the primary decision should be reviewed.

The decision on the Internal review will be provided to you within 30 days of the Department receiving your application.

You can submit your written Internal review application to the below addresses:

Email: foi@environment.gov.au

Post: FOI Contact Officer
General Counsel Branch
Department of the Environment and Energy
GPO Box 787
Canberra ACT 2601

Information Commissioner review

An Information Commissioner review is a review undertaken by the Information Commissioner (IC). The IC will make a decision on the disclosure of the documents, giving regard to any submissions from the Department, yourself as the applicant, and any third parties consulted as part of this decision.

There is no statutory timeframe for a decision on an IC request.

If you wish to request a review by the IC, you must apply to the IC within 60 days after the day you received it. Further details on how to request an Information Commissioner review can be obtained from the Office of the Australian Information Commissioner:

Online: <https://www.oaic.gov.au/freedom-of-information/foi-review-process>
Post: GPO Box 5218, Sydney NSW 2001
Fax: 02 9284 9666
Phone: 1300 363 992
Email: enquiries@oaic.gov.au