



Internal review decision made under the *Freedom of Information Act 1982*

Applicant: Phillip Sweeney

Decision-maker: Ben (person number 2355), an authorised officer of the Australian Prudential Regulation Authority (APRA) for the purposes of section 23(1) of the *Freedom of Information Act 1982* ('FOI Act').

FOI reference: FOI 20 – 11

Decision: Grant access to the document listed in the Schedule.

Affirm the original FOI decision to refuse access to the other documents subject to your request because the documents could not be found or do not exist.

Summary

1. On 9 August 2019 you made the following FOI request:

"The documents I seek are:

*(i) a copy of the letter provided to APRA by Nicholas Brookes, the then CEO of Corporate Combined Superannuation (CCSL Ltd) {RSE Licence L0000758}, the then purported corporate trustee of this regulated superannuation fund (R 1004830); and
(ii) copies of all the documents which were attached to this letter signed by Mr Brookes."*

('your original FOI request')

2. On 4 October 2019 APRA made the decision to refuse access to the documents on the basis of section 24A of the FOI Act in response to your original FOI request ('the original FOI decision').

3. On 10 October 2019 APRA received your email request for an internal review of APRA's original FOI decision ('the internal review application').

Material taken into account

4. I relied on the following evidence and material in making my decision:

- a) your original FOI request;
- b) acknowledgment of FOI request from FOI Officer to the Applicant dated 9 August 2019;
- c) email correspondence between APRA staff between 26 August and 4 September 2019 and 4 October 2019;
- d) file note dated 4 October 2019;

- e) notice of decision dated 4 October 2019;
- f) the internal review application;
- g) memorandum from FOI Officer dated 4 November 2019;
- h) relevant sections of the *Australian Prudential Regulation Authority Act 1998* (Cth) (APRA Act);
- i) relevant sections of the FOI Act; and
- j) guidelines issued by the Office of the Australian Information Commissioner to date (FOI Guidelines).

Reasons

5. Paragraphs of the original FOI decision are reproduced below:

*“APRA has conducted all reasonable searches of its records in order to identify all documents relevant to your FOI request (**relevant documents**).*

I have decided to refuse access to the relevant documents for the following reason:

Documents cannot be found, do not exist or have not been received.

Based on the information before me, APRA has taken all reasonable steps to locate the documents relevant to the request and I am satisfied that the documents cannot be found/do not exist. Accordingly, I refuse access under section 24A of the FOI Act.”

6. You made the following statement in support of your internal review application:

“I have a copy of the letter from Mr Nicholas Brookes to APRA dated 24 June 2010 which lists the attached documents numbered 1 to 7.

Documents listed at item 5 were:

- (a) Rules dated 19 August 1985*
- (b) Amendments dated 26 August 1986*
- (c) Amendments dated 15 December 1986*
- (d) Register of executed deeds*

Therefore APRA must have in its possession a copy of these documents otherwise they have been deliberately destroyed.”

7. I considered your statement in detail and reviewed all relevant documentation and the process of investigation undertaken by the FOI Officer. I identified an additional document in making the internal review decision. I have decided to grant you access to the document set out in the schedule.
8. In relation to the other documents subject to your request, I am satisfied APRA conducted all reasonable searches of its records in order to locate these documents having regard to:
- a) APRA's record management systems and practices;
 - b) the areas within APRA who are able to assist with the location of these documents; and

- c) the current and past file management systems and the practice of orderly destruction or removal of documents.
9. APRA undertook searches of its file index and searches of its electronic file systems. APRA also circulated emails internally to relevant areas requesting they conduct searches of their respective file systems.
 10. Following these searches, these documents cannot be found, do not exist or have not been received. I have affirmed the remainder of the original FOI decision to refuse access to the other documents subject to your request because the documents could not be found or do not exist.

Rights of review

11. Under section 54L of the FOI Act, you have the right to apply to the OAIC for a review of my decision. The application for review by the OAIC must be made in writing within 60 days of the date of this letter, and be lodged in one of the following ways:

Online	https://forms.business.gov.au/aba/oaic/foi-review-/
Post	GPO Box 5218, Sydney NSW 2001
Email	FOIDR@oaic.gov.au
Facsimile	(02) 9284 9666
Street address	Office of the Australian Information Commissioner Level 3, 175 Pitt Street Sydney NSW 2000

12. More information about your review rights under the FOI Act is available here: <https://www.oaic.gov.au/freedom-of-information/foi-guidelines/part-10-review-by-the-information-commissioner/>

Ben (person number 2355)
FOI Officer

11 November 2019

AUSTRALIAN PRUDENTIAL REGULATION AUTHORITY

1 Martin Place (Level 12), Sydney, NSW 2000

GPO Box 9836, Sydney, NSW 2001

T 02 9210 3000 | W www.apra.gov.au**Schedule**

Doc No.	Description	Exemption(s)	Access
1	Letter		Granted

FREEDOM OF INFORMATION ACT 1982

11A Access to documents on request

Scope

- (1) This section applies if:
- (a) a request is made by a person, in accordance with subsection 15(2), to an agency or Minister for access to:
 - (i) a document of the agency; or
 - (ii) an official document of the Minister; and
 - (b) any charge that, under the regulations, is required to be paid before access is given has been paid.

- (2) This section applies subject to this Act.

Note: Other provisions of this Act are relevant to decisions about access to documents, for example the following:

- (a) section 12 (documents otherwise available);
- (b) section 13 (documents in national institutions);
- (c) section 15A (personnel records);
- (d) section 22 (access to edited copies with exempt or irrelevant matter deleted).

Mandatory access—general rule

- (3) The agency or Minister must give the person access to the document in accordance with this Act, subject to this section.

Exemptions and conditional exemptions

- (4) The agency or Minister is not required by this Act to give the person access to the document at a particular time if, at that time, the document is an exempt document.

Note: Access may be given to an exempt document apart from under this Act, whether or not in response to a request (see section 3A (objects—information or documents otherwise accessible)).

- (5) The agency or Minister must give the person access to the document if it is conditionally exempt at a particular time unless (in the circumstances) access to the document at that time would, on balance, be contrary to the public interest.

Note 1: Division 3 of Part IV provides for when a document is conditionally exempt.

Note 2: A conditionally exempt document is an exempt document if access to the document would, on balance, be contrary to the public interest (see section 31B (exempt documents for the purposes of Part IV)).

Note 3: Section 11B deals with when it is contrary to the public interest to give a person access to the document.

- (6) Despite subsection (5), the agency or Minister is not required to give access to the document at a particular time if, at that time, the document is both:
- (a) a conditionally exempt document; and
 - (b) an exempt document:
 - (i) under Division 2 of Part IV (exemptions); or
 - (ii) within the meaning of paragraph (b) or (c) of the definition of **exempt document** in subsection 4(1).

24A Requests may be refused if documents cannot be found, do not exist or have not been received

Document lost or non-existent

- (1) An agency or Minister may refuse a request for access to a document if:
 - (a) all reasonable steps have been taken to find the document; and
 - (b) the agency or Minister is satisfied that the document:
 - (i) is in the agency's or Minister's possession but cannot be found; or
 - (ii) does not exist.

Document not received as required by contract

- (2) An agency may refuse a request for access to a document if:
 - (a) in order to comply with section 6C, the agency has taken contractual measures to ensure that it receives the document; and
 - (b) the agency has not received the document; and
 - (c) the agency has taken all reasonable steps to receive the document in accordance with those contractual measures.

38 Documents to which secrecy provisions of enactments apply

- (1) Subject to subsection (1A), a document is an exempt document if:
 - (a) disclosure of the document, or information contained in the document, is prohibited under a provision of an enactment; and
 - (b) either:
 - (i) that provision is specified in Schedule 3; or
 - (ii) this section is expressly applied to the document, or information, by that provision, or by another provision of that or any other enactment.
- (1A) A person's right of access to a document under section 11 or 22 is not affected merely because the document is an exempt document under subsection (1) of this section if disclosure of the document, or information contained in the document, to that person is not prohibited by the enactment concerned or any other enactment.
- (2) Subject to subsection (3), if a person requests access to a document, this section does not apply in relation to the document so far as it contains personal information about the person.
- (3) This section applies in relation to a document so far as it contains personal information about a person if:
 - (a) the person requests access to the document; and
 - (b) disclosure of the document, or information contained in the document, is prohibited under section 503A of the *Migration Act 1958* as affected by section 503D of that Act.
- (4) In this section:
enactment includes a Norfolk Island enactment.

AUSTRALIAN PRUDENTIAL REGULATION AUTHORITY ACT 1998

56 Secrecy—general obligations

- (1) In this section:
body regulated by APRA includes a body that has at any time been a body regulated by APRA.

court includes a tribunal, authority or person having the power to require the production of documents or the answering of questions.

financial sector entity has the same meaning as in the *Financial Sector (Collection of Data) Act 2001*.

officer means:

- (a) an APRA member; or
- (b) an APRA staff member; or
- (c) any other person who, because of his or her employment, or in the course of that employment:
 - (i) has acquired protected information; or
 - (ii) has had access to protected documents;other than an employee of the body to which the information or document relates.

personal information has the same meaning as in the *Privacy Act 1988*.

produce includes permit access to.

protected document means a document given or produced (whether before or after the commencement of this section) under, or for the purposes of, a prudential regulation framework law and containing information relating to the affairs of:

- (a) a financial sector entity; or
- (b) a body corporate (including a body corporate that has ceased to exist) that has at any time been, or is, related (within the meaning of the *Corporations Act 2001*) to a body regulated by APRA or to a registered entity; or
- (c) a person who has been, is, or proposes to be, a customer of a body regulated by APRA or of a registered entity;; or
- (ca) a person in relation to whom information is, or was, required to be given under a reporting standard made in accordance with subsection 13(4A) of the *Financial Sector (Collection of Data) Act 2001*;

other than:

- (d) a document containing information that has already been lawfully made available to the public from other sources; or
- (e) a document given or produced under, or for the purposes of, a provision of the *Superannuation Industry (Supervision) Act 1993*:
 - (i) administered by the Commissioner of Taxation; or
 - (ii) being applied for the purposes of the administration of a provision administered by the Commissioner of Taxation.

It also includes a document that is given to APRA under Part 7.5A of the *Corporations Act 2001*, other than a document containing information that has already been lawfully made available to the public from other sources.

protected information means information disclosed or obtained (whether before or after the commencement of this section) under, or for the purposes of, a prudential regulation framework law and relating to the affairs of:

- (a) a financial sector entity; or
- (b) a body corporate (including a body corporate that has ceased to exist) that has at any time been, or is, related (within the meaning of the *Corporations Act 2001*) to a body regulated by APRA or to a registered entity; or
- (c) a person who has been, is, or proposes to be, a customer of a body regulated by APRA or of a registered entity;; or
- (ca) a person in relation to whom information is, or was, required to be given under a reporting standard made in accordance with subsection 13(4A) of the *Financial Sector (Collection of Data) Act 2001*;

other than:

- (d) information that has already been lawfully made available to the public from other sources; or
- (e) information given or produced under, or for the purposes of, a provision of the *Superannuation Industry (Supervision) Act 1993*.

- (i) administered by the Commissioner of Taxation; or
- (ii) being applied for the purposes of the administration of a provision administered by the Commissioner of Taxation.

It also includes information that is given to APRA under Part 7.5A of the *Corporations Act 2001*, other than information that has already been lawfully made available to the public from other sources.

registered entity means a corporation that is, or has at any time been, a registered entity within the meaning of the *Financial Sector (Collection of Data) Act 2001*.

- (2) A person who is or has been an officer is guilty of an offence if:
- (a) the person directly or indirectly:
 - (i) discloses information acquired in the course of his or her duties as an officer to any person or to a court; or
 - (ii) produces a document to any person or to a court; and
 - (b) the information is protected information, or the document is a protected document; and
 - (c) the disclosure or production is not in accordance with subsection (3), (4), (5), (5AA), (5A), (5B), (5C), (6), (7), (7A), (7B) or (7C).

Penalty: Imprisonment for 2 years.

Note: Chapter 2 of the *Criminal Code* sets out the general principles of criminal responsibility.

- (3) It is not an offence if the disclosure of protected information or the production of a protected document by a person is for the purposes of a prudential regulation framework law.

Note: A defendant bears an evidential burden in relation to the matters in subsection (3) (see subsection 13.3(3) of the *Criminal Code*).

- (4) It is not an offence if the disclosure of protected information or the production of a protected document by a person:
- (a) is by an employee of the person to whose affairs the information or document relates; or
 - (b) occurs after the person to whose affairs the information or document relates has agreed in writing to the disclosure or production.

Note: A defendant bears an evidential burden in relation to the matters in subsection (4) (see subsection 13.3(3) of the *Criminal Code*).

- (5) It is not an offence if the disclosure of protected information or the production of a protected document by a person:
- (a) occurs when the person is satisfied that the disclosure of the information, or the production of the document, will assist a financial sector supervisory agency, or any other agency (including foreign agencies) specified in the regulations, to perform its functions or exercise its powers and the disclosure or production is to that agency; or
 - (b) is to another person and is approved by APRA by instrument in writing.

Note: A defendant bears an evidential burden in relation to the matters in subsection (5) (see subsection 13.3(3) of the *Criminal Code*).

- (5AA) It is not an offence if the disclosure of protected information or the production of a protected document is made:
- (a) by an officer of an agency to which the information or document has been disclosed or produced under paragraph (5)(a); and
 - (b) for the same purpose as the information or document was so disclosed or produced to that agency.

Note: A defendant bears an evidential burden in relation to the matters in subsection (5AA) (see subsection 13.3(3) of the *Criminal Code*).

- (5A) It is not an offence if the production by a person of a document that was given to APRA under section 9 or 13 of the *Financial Sector (Collection of Data) Act 2001* is to the Australian Statistician for the purposes of the *Census and Statistics Act 1905*.

Note: A defendant bears an evidential burden in relation to matters in subsection (5A) (see subsection 13.3(3) of the *Criminal Code*).

- (5B) It is not an offence if the production by a person of a document that was given to APRA under section 9 or 13 of the *Financial Sector (Collection of Data) Act 2001* is to:

- (a) the Reserve Bank of Australia; or
- (b) another prescribed authority.

Note: A defendant bears an evidential burden in relation to matters in subsection (5B) (see subsection 13.3(3) of the *Criminal Code*).

- (5C) If:

- (a) a document is a reporting document given to APRA under section 13 of the *Financial Sector (Collection of Data) Act 2001*; and
- (b) either:
 - (i) a determination has been made under section 57 that the document does not, or documents of that kind do not, contain confidential information; or
 - (ii) a determination has been made under section 57 that a specified part of the document, or of documents of that kind, does not contain confidential information;

it is not an offence to disclose the document or that part of the document, or any information contained in the document or that part of the document, to any person (including by making the document, the part of the document or the information available on APRA's website).

- (6) It is not an offence if the disclosure of protected information or the production of a protected document is to:

- (a) an APRA member; or
- (b) an APRA staff member;

for the purposes of the performance of APRA's functions, or the exercise of APRA's powers, under a law of the Commonwealth or of a State or a Territory.

Note: A defendant bears an evidential burden in relation to the matters in subsection (6) (see subsection 13.3(3) of the *Criminal Code*).

- (6A) It is not an offence if the disclosure of protected information or the production of a protected document is to:

- (a) an auditor who has provided, or is providing, professional services to a general insurer, authorised NOHC or a subsidiary of a general insurer or authorised NOHC; or
- (b) an actuary who has provided, or is providing, professional services to a general insurer, authorised NOHC or a subsidiary of a general insurer or authorised NOHC;

and the disclosure is for the purposes of the performance of APRA's functions, or the exercise of APRA's powers, under a law of the Commonwealth or of a State or Territory.

- (7) It is not an offence if the information, or the information contained in the document, as the case may be, is in the form of a summary or collection of information that is prepared so that information relating to any particular person cannot be found out from it.

Note: A defendant bears an evidential burden in relation to the matters in subsection (7) (see subsection 13.3(3) of the *Criminal Code*).

- (7A) It is not an offence if the information, or the information contained in the document, as the case may be, is all or any of the following:

- (a) the names of bodies that are regulated by APRA;
- (b) the addresses at which bodies referred to in paragraph (a) conduct business;
- (c) any other information that is reasonably necessary to enable members of the public to contact persons who perform functions in relation to bodies referred to in paragraph (a).

Note: A defendant bears an evidential burden in relation to the matters in subsection (7A) (see subsection 13.3(3) of the *Criminal Code*).

- (7B) It is not an offence if the information, or the information contained in the document, as the case may be, is:
- (a) a statement of APRA's opinion as to whether or not a body regulated by APRA is complying, or was complying at a particular time, with a particular provision of a prudential regulation framework law; or
 - (b) a description of:
 - (i) court proceedings in relation to a breach or suspected breach by a person of a provision of a prudential regulation framework law; or
 - (ii) activity engaged in, or proposed to be engaged in, by APRA in relation to such a breach or suspected breach; or
 - (c) a description of action under a prudential regulation framework law that APRA has taken or is proposing to take in relation to:
 - (i) a body regulated by APRA; or
 - (ii) an individual who holds or has held a position with or in relation to such a body.

Note: A defendant bears an evidential burden in relation to the matters in subsection (7B) (see subsection 13.3(3) of the *Criminal Code*).

- (7C) If information referred to in subsection (7A) or paragraph (7B)(a) that relates to a body that is, or has at any time been, regulated by APRA under the *Superannuation Industry (Supervision) Act 1993* is disclosed to the Registrar of the Australian Business Register established under section 24 of the *A New Tax System (Australian Business Number) Act 1999*, the Registrar may enter the information in that Register.

Note: A defendant bears an evidential burden in relation to the matters in subsection (7C) (see subsection 13.3(3) of the *Criminal Code*).

- (8) A person who is, or has been, an officer cannot be required to disclose to a court any protected information, or to produce in a court a protected document, except when it is necessary to do so for the purposes of a prudential regulation framework law.
- (9) If a person discloses information or produces a document under this section to another person, the first person may, at the time of the disclosure, impose conditions to be complied with in relation to the information disclosed or the document produced.
- (10) A person is guilty of an offence if the person fails to comply with a condition imposed under subsection (9).

Penalty: Imprisonment for 2 years.

Note: Chapter 2 of the *Criminal Code* sets out the general principles of criminal responsibility.

- (11) A document that:
- (a) is a protected document; or
 - (b) contains protected information;
- is an exempt document for the purposes of section 38 of the *Freedom of Information Act 1982*.

Note: For additional rules about personal information, see the *Privacy Act 1988*.

- (12) A disclosure of personal information is taken to be authorised by this Act for the purposes of paragraph 6.2(b) of Australian Privacy Principle 6 if:
- (a) the information is protected information and the disclosure is made in accordance with any of subsections (4), (5), (5AA), (6), (7A), (7B) and (7C); or
 - (b) the information is contained in a protected document and the disclosure is made by the production of the document in accordance with any of those subsections.