



Australian Government
Attorney-General's Department

Our ref: FOI19/263; CM19/10398

4 December 2019

Chris H

By email: foi+request-5911-3774a8e0@righttoknow.org.au

Freedom of Information Request FOI19/263 – Request Consultation Process

The purpose of this letter is to seek information from you about access to documents that you requested under the *Freedom of Information Act 1982* (the FOI Act).

Your Request

On 15 November 2019, you requested access as follows:

I would like to request documents or any relevant information that suggest that not all trials require a jury.

Or, provide any documents that overrule or suggest that section 80 of the 'Commonwealth of Australia Constitution Act 1900' is invalid.

The 'Commonwealth of Australia Constitution Act 1900' states:

Section

80 Trial by Jury

The trial on indictment of any offence against any law of the Commonwealth shall be by jury, and every such trial shall be held in the State where the offence was committed, and if the offence was not committed within any State the trial shall be held at such place or places as the Parliament prescribes.'

On 21 November 2019, the Attorney-General's Department (the department) acknowledged your request.

Practical Refusal Reason

I am an officer authorised under subsection 23(1) of the FOI Act to make decisions in relation to freedom of information requests made to the department.

I have decided that the work involved in processing your request in its current form would substantially and unreasonably divert the resources of this department from its other operations due to its broad scope. Section 24AA of the FOI Act refers to this as a 'practical refusal reason' (copy at **Attachment A**).

A preliminary search of the department's holdings indicates the department holds up to 36,000 documents relevant to the terms of your request. The departmental resources required to identify, locate and collate all documents within the scope of your request, and decide whether to

grant, refuse or defer access to each of those documents would unreasonably divert the resources of the department from its other operations.

Request Consultation Process

Before I make a decision to refuse access to the documents you requested, section 24AB of the FOI Act provides for a 'request consultation process' (copy at **Attachment A**). This means you have 14 days in which to respond to this notice revising your request in one of the ways described below.

If you would like to proceed with your FOI request, you must make a revised request, in writing, within 14 days of the date you receive this letter.

Revising your request can mean narrowing the scope of the request to make it more manageable or explaining in more detail the documents you wish to access. For example, by providing more specific information about exactly what documents or material you are interested in, the department may be able to identify the documents more quickly and avoid using excessive resources to process documents that are not of interest to you. You could also limit the scope of your request to certain types of documents or exclude certain types of documents, or limit the timeframe of your request (for example, requesting documents created only after a specified year).

During the consultation period, you are welcome to seek assistance from the contact person listed below to revise your request. If you revise your request in a way that adequately addresses the practical refusal grounds outlined above, the department will recommence processing it. Please note that the time taken to consult you about the scope of your request is not included in the 30 day time limit for processing your request.

If you do not wish to proceed with your FOI request, you may either withdraw your request or advise the department that you do not wish to revise your request. Your request will be withdrawn if you do not contact us or provide written notice of the revised scope of your request within 14 days from receipt of this notice.

Further information: section 80 of the Constitution

The Australian Government does not provide or release legal advice to the public. However, the following general comments may be of assistance.

Section 80 of the Constitution provides, in part, that the 'trial on indictment of any offence against any law of the Commonwealth shall be by jury'. The requirement in section 80 thus applies to Commonwealth offences, not to State offences. It follows that section 80 would not apply, for example, to a trial on indictment for an offence under a State criminal code. Additionally, section 80 only applies to a 'trial on indictment'. Some offences, typically described as 'summary offences', are not tried on indictment. These are generally less serious than 'indictable offences'. A trial for a Commonwealth offence not 'on indictment' (a summary offence) will also not engage section 80, and a jury will not be required by section 80.

A proposal to alter the Constitution to extend the right to trial by jury to offences created by laws made by State Parliaments that are tried on indictment was defeated at a referendum in 1988.

Review Rights and Questions

Your review rights under the FOI Act are set out at **Attachment B** to this letter.

If you wish to discuss this decision, the FOI case officer for this matter is Fiona, who can be reached on (02) 6141 6666 or at foi@ag.gov.au.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'D. Lewis', with a stylized flourish at the end.

David Lewis
Acting General Counsel (Constitutional)
Office of Constitutional Law

Attachments

Attachment A: Sections 24AA and 24AB of the FOI Act

Attachment B: Review Rights

Attachment A

Section 24AA of the FOI Act: When does a practical refusal reason exist?

- (1) For the purposes of section 24, a practical refusal reason exists in relation to a request for a document if either (or both) of the following applies:
 - (a) the work involved in processing the request:
 - (i) in the case of an agency--would substantially and unreasonably divert the resources of the agency from its other operations; or
 - (ii) in the case of a Minister--would substantially and unreasonably interfere with the performance of the Minister's functions;
 - (b) the request does not satisfy the requirement in paragraph 15(2)(b) (identification of documents).
- (2) Subject to subsection (3), but without limiting the matters to which the agency or Minister may have regard, in deciding whether a practical refusal reason exists, the agency or Minister must have regard to the resources that would have to be used for the following:
 - (a) identifying, locating or collating the documents within the filing system of the agency, or the office of the Minister;
 - (b) deciding whether to grant, refuse or defer access to a document to which the request relates, or to grant access to an edited copy of such a document, including resources that would have to be used for:
 - (i) examining the document; or
 - (ii) consulting with any person or body in relation to the request;
 - (c) making a copy, or an edited copy, of the document;
 - (d) notifying any interim or final decision on the request.
- (3) In deciding whether a practical refusal reason exists, an agency or Minister must not have regard to:
 - (a) any reasons that the applicant gives for requesting access; or
 - (b) the agency's or Minister's belief as to what the applicant's reasons are for requesting access; or
 - (c) any maximum amount, specified in the regulations, payable as a charge for processing a request of that kind.

Section 24AB of the FOI Act: What is a request consultation process?

Scope

- (1) This section sets out what is a request consultation process for the purposes of section 24.

Requirement to notify

- (2) The agency or Minister must give the applicant a written notice stating the following:
 - (a) an intention to refuse access to a document in accordance with a request;
 - (b) the practical refusal reason;

- (c) the name of an officer of the agency or member of staff of the Minister (the contact person) with whom the applicant may consult during a period;
- (d) details of how the applicant may contact the contact person;
- (e) that the period (the consultation period) during which the applicant may consult with the contact person is 14 days after the day the applicant is given the notice.

Assistance to revise request

- (3) If the applicant contacts the contact person during the consultation period in accordance with the notice, the agency or Minister must take reasonable steps to assist the applicant to revise the request so that the practical refusal reason no longer exists.
- (4) For the purposes of subsection (3), reasonable steps includes the following:
 - (a) giving the applicant a reasonable opportunity to consult with the contact person;
 - (b) providing the applicant with any information that would assist the applicant to revise the request.

Extension of consultation period

- (5) The contact person may, with the applicant's agreement, extend the consultation period by written notice to the applicant.

Outcome of request consultation process

- (6) The applicant must, before the end of the consultation period, do one of the following, by written notice to the agency or Minister:
 - (a) withdraw the request;
 - (b) make a revised request;
 - (c) indicate that the applicant does not wish to revise the request.
- (7) The request is taken to have been withdrawn under subsection (6) at the end of the consultation period if:
 - (a) the applicant does not consult the contact person during the consultation period in accordance with the notice; or
 - (b) the applicant does not do one of the things mentioned in subsection (6) before the end of the consultation period.

Consultation period to be disregarded in calculating processing period

- (8) The period starting on the day an applicant is given a notice under subsection (2) and ending on the day the applicant does one of the things mentioned in paragraph (6)(b) or (c) is to be disregarded in working out the 30 day period mentioned in paragraph 15(5)(b).

Note: Paragraph 15(5)(b) requires that an agency or Minister take all reasonable steps to notify an applicant of a decision on the applicant's request within 30 days after the request is made.

No more than one request consultation process required

- (9) To avoid doubt, this section only obliges the agency or Minister to undertake a request consultation process once for any particular request.

Attachment B

Review Rights

If you are dissatisfied with the decision of the Attorney-General's Department (the department), you may apply for internal review or Information Commissioner review of the decision.

The department encourages applicants to consider seeking internal review as a first step as it may provide a more rapid resolution of your concerns.

Internal review

Under section 54 of the *Freedom of Information Act 1982* (FOI Act), applications for internal review must be made in writing within 30 days of the date of the decision letter. Applications for internal review must be lodged by email or post.

email: foi@ag.gov.au
post: Freedom of Information and Parliamentary Section
Strategy and Governance Branch
Attorney-General's Department
3-5 National Circuit
BARTON ACT 2600

An officer of the department other than the officer who made the original decision will complete the internal review within 30 days of receipt of your request.

Providing reasons you believe internal review of the decision is necessary will facilitate the completion of the internal review.

Information Commissioner review

Under section 54L of the FOI Act, you may apply to the Australian Information Commissioner to review my decision. An application for review by the Information Commissioner must be made in writing within 60 days of the date of the decision letter, and can be lodged in one of the following ways:

online: <https://forms.business.gov.au/aba/oaic/foi-review/>
email: enquiries@oaic.gov.au
post: GPO Box 5218, SYDNEY NSW 2001
in person: Level 3, 175 Pitt Street, SYDNEY NSW 2000

More information about Information Commissioner review is available on the Office of the Australian Information Commissioner website.

Go to <http://www.oaic.gov.au/freedom-of-information/foi-reviews>